# BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENT COURT AT AUCKLAND

# I MUA I TE KÖTI TAIAO O AOTEAROA KI TÄMAKI MAKAURAU

IN THE MATTER

of the Resource Management Act 1991

AND

of appeals under Clause 14 of Schedule 1 of

the Act

**BETWEEN** 

MINISTER OF CONSERVATION

(ENV-2019-AKL-000296)

PETROLEUM EXPLORATION AND PRODUCTION ASSOCIATION OF

NEW ZEALAND

(ENV-2019-AKL-000297)

ROYAL FOREST AND BIRD PROTECTION SOCIETY OF NEW

ZEALAND INCORPORATED

(ENV-2019-AKL-00298)

FONTERRA LIMITED

(ENV-2019-AKL-000303)

Appellants

AND

TARANAKI REGIONAL COUNCIL

Respondent

Court:

Environment Judge M J L Dickey sitting alone under section 279 of

the Act

Date of Order:

1 7 MAY 2021

Date of Issue:

1 7 MAY 2021

# CONSENT ORDER



- A: Under section 279(1)(b) of the Resource Management Act 1991, the Environment Court, by consent, orders that:
  - (1) The appeals are allowed in part subject to the amendments to the proposed Taranaki Coastal Plan set out in **Appendix A** to this order;
  - (2) The appeal points from Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated's appeal set out in paragraph [7] of this order are confirmed as withdrawn.
  - (3) Topic 1 (Biodiversity) and Topic 3 (Infrastructure and Industry) are resolved. Topic 4 (Oil and Gas) remains extant; and
  - (4) The appeals by Fonterra Limited, the Minister of Conservation, and Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated are resolved. The appeal by Petroleum Exploration and Production Association of New Zealand remains extant.
- B: Under section 285 of the Resource Management Act 1991, there is no order as to costs.

# **REASONS**

#### Introduction

- [1] These appeals concern Taranaki Regional Council's (the Council) decisions on the Proposed Taranaki Coastal Plan.
- [2] The Minister of Conservation, Petroleum Exploration and Production Association of New Zealand (**PEPANZ**), Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated (**RFB**), and Fonterra Limited have appealed the Council's decisions on the Proposed Taranaki Coastal Plan in relation to a number of the objectives, policies, rules, methods and definitions.
- [3] This order resolves appeal points under Topic 1 (Biodiversity), Topic 3 (Infrastructure and Industry), and Topic 4 (Oil and Gas).

- [4] The following have given notice of an intention to become a party under section 274 of the Act and have signed the joint memorandum in support of the consent order:
  - (a) Minister of Conservation;
  - (b) PEPANZ;
  - (c) Port Taranaki Limited;
  - (d) RFB;
  - (e) Trans-Tasman Resources Limited;
  - (f) Federated Farmers of New Zealand;
  - (g) New Zealand Sport Fishing Council Incorporated;
  - (h) South Taranaki District Council; and
  - (i) Fonterra Limited.

# Agreement reached

- [5] Following informal and Court-assisted mediation, the parties have reached agreement on a proposal to resolve aspects of these appeals.
- [6] The parties have agreed the following changes to the Taranaki Coastal Plan:
  - (a) Amending Objective 8;
  - (b) Amending Policy 2;
  - (c) Amending Policy 14;
  - (d) Amending Policy 14A;
  - (e) Amending Policy 28;
  - (f) Amending Policy 34;
  - (g) Amending Policy 41;
  - (h) Amending Policy 49;
  - (i) Amending Section 6.1 ·
  - (j) Amending Rule 12;
  - (k) Amending Rule 12A;
  - (l) Amending Rules 25 and 25A;
  - (m) Amending Section 8.6.2;
  - (n) Amending the definition of "regionally important infrastructure"; and

(o) Amending Schedule 4.

#### Withdrawal

- [7] RFB has agreed to withdraw its appeal points in relation to the following provisions with no changes to the provisions being required:
  - (a) Policies 2, 29 and 42;
  - (b) Proposed Policy 14AA and Schedule X;
  - (c) Section 6.10;
  - (d) Rules 26, 28, 30 and 52;
  - (e) Section 8.5 General Standards;
  - (f) Section 8.6.3 General Standards: Noise;
  - (g) Schedules 1 and 4.
- [8] I confirm the withdrawal of these appeal points.

### Consideration

- [9] In making this order the Court has read and considered the appeals and the memoranda of parties dated 7 December 2020 and 29 April 2021.
- [10] The parties have assured the Court that they consider the amendments give effect to the New Zealand Coastal Policy Statement, and do not directly engage any other National Policy Statement.
- [11] The Court is making this order under section 279(1) of the Act, such order being by consent, rather than representing a decision or determination on the merits pursuant to section 297. The Court understands for present purposes that:
  - (a) all parties to the proceedings with an interest in the matters to be resolved by this order have executed the memorandum of the parties requesting this order; and

(b) all parties are satisfied that all matters proposed for the Court's endorsement are within the scope of relief sought in the appellants' notices of appeal, fall within the Court's jurisdiction, and conform to the relevant requirements and objectives of the Act including, in particular, Part 2.

### **Orders**

- [12] Therefore the Court orders, by consent, that the Proposed Taranaki Coastal Plan is amended in accordance with **Appendix A**. The appeal points in relation to these provisions are otherwise dismissed.
- [13] The appeal points from Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated's appeal set out in paragraph [7] above are confirmed as withdrawn.
- [14] Topic 1 (Biodiversity) and Topic 3 (Infrastructure and Industry) are resolved. Topic 4 (Oil and Gas) remain extant.
- [15] The appeals by Fonterra Limited, the Minister of Conservation, and Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated are resolved.
- [16] There is no order as to costs.

M J L Dickey

**Environment Judge** 

# Appendix A

Approved amendments to the Proposed Taranaki Coastal Plan (based on *Track changes version: Council's decisions*)

Appendix A: Approved Amendments to the Proposed Taranaki Coastal Plan (based on Track changes version: Council's decisions)

Provision	Amendments (additions are identified with underlined text; deletions are identified with struck out text)							
Objective 8	Objective 8: Indigenous biodiversity							
	Indigenous biodiversity in the coastal environment is maintained and enhanced and areas of significant indigenous biodiversity in the coastal environment are is protected.							
Policy 2	Policy 2: Integrated management Provide for the integrated management of the coastal environment by:							
	(aa)							
	(f) managing natural and physical resources in a manner that recognises and provides for the social, economic and cultural objectives and well-being of the community and the functional needs and/or operational needs of regionally important infrastructure and industry; and							
	(g)							
Policy 14	Policy 14: Significant indigenous biodiversity Protect significant indigenous biodiversity in the coastal environment by:							
	(a) avoiding adverse effects of activities on:							
	(i) indigenous taxa that are nationally threatened or at risk, or regionally distinctive, including those identified in Schedule 4A;							
	(ii) taxa that are internationally threatened including those identified in Schedule 4A;							
	(iii) indigenous ecosystems and vegetation types that are threatened in the coastal environment, or are naturally rare, as-including those identified in Schedule 4A;							
	(iv)							
	(b) avoiding significant adverse effects and avoiding, remedying and mitigating other adverse effects of activities on:							
	(i) areas of predominantly indigenous vegetation in the coastal environment;							
	(ii) habitats in the coastal environment that are important during the vulnerable life stage of indigenous species including:							
	i							
	(iii) indigenous ecosystems and habitats found only in the coastal environment and which are particularly vulnerable to modification including estuaries, lagoons, coastal wetlands, dunelands, intertidal zones, rocky reef systems, eelgrass, saltmarsh, and sensitive marine benthic habitats as-including those identified in Schedule 4B;							
	(iv)							

Provision	Amendments (additions are identified with underlined text; deletions are identified with struck out text)									
Policy 14A	Policy 14A: Indigenous biodiversity  Maintain or enhance indigenous biodiversity generally in the coastal environment by:									
	(a) avoiding, remedying and mitigating the adverse effects of activities on indigenous biodiversity; and									
	(b) when assessing adverse effects on indigenous biodiversity, having regard to the extent of effects, including consideration of:									
	(iA) the size and sensitivity of the ecological site and/or values;									
	<ul><li>(i) the association of the ecological site and values with other interrelated, but not necessarily contiguous, ecological sites and values;</li><li>(ii) the nature, location, extent and design of the proposed development and the effects of these factors on indigenous biodiversity;</li></ul>									
	(iii) the degree to which indigenous biodiversity values will be lost, damaged, destroyed, or enhanced, recognising that:									
	<ol> <li>the scale of the effect of an activity is proportional to the size and sensitivity of the ecological area and associated indigenous biodiversity values transitory, discrete, localised or otherwise minor effects may be acceptable;</li> </ol>									
	ii. discrete, localised or otherwise minor effects not impacting on the ecological area may long-term and/or irreversible effects are less likely to be acceptable; and									
	iii. activities with transitory effects may be acceptable, where they can demonstrate the effects are not long-term and/or irreversible there may be more than minor cumulative effects that arise from minor or transitory effects described in i.									
Policy 28	Policy 28: Harmful aquatic organisms  The following activities in the coastal marine area must be managed in a way that prevents or minimises the risk of introduction or spread of harmful aquatic organisms:									
	(a)									
Policy 34	Policy 34: Appropriateness of hard protection structures  Hard protection structures are discouraged and the use of alternatives promoted, whilst recognising that hard protection structures may be the only practicable means to protect existing nationally and regionally important infrastructure which may include nationally and regionally important infrastructure associated with existing industry.									
	Appropriateness of hard protection structures must be assessed by the provision of evidence that demonstrates:									
	(a)									
Policy 41	Policy 41: Disturbance, deposition or extraction activities that provide public or environmental benefit  Subject to appropriate avoidance, remediation or mitigation of adverse effects, Aallow disturbance, deposition or extraction that is necessary to provide for public or environmental benefit, subject to appropriate avoidance, remediation or mitigation of adverse effects, including:									
	(a)									

Provision	Amendments (additions are identified with underlined text; deletions are identified with struck out text)							
Policy 49	Policy 49: Noise and vibration  Avoid, remedy or mitigate adverse environmental effects of Nnoise and vibration from activities undertaken in the coastal marine area, including underwater activities, will be managed to avoid, remedy or mitigate adverse environmental effects.							
Section 6.1	5A  5B. Identify sites in the Department of (a) include these (b) consider include 6	istal Policy Statement Policy 11, in conju	nction with					
Rule 12	Bathymetric analysis  Activity  Discharge of energy for the purpose of bathymetric analysis into water in the coastal marine area.  Note: If the activity is not covered by this Rule or does not meet the standards, terms and conditions in this Rule refer to Rule 13 or Rule 14 depending on the Coastal Management Area involved.	Coastal management area Outstanding Value Estuaries Unmodified Estuaries Modified Open Coast Port	Classification Permitted	Standards/terms/conditions  (a) Taranaki Regional Council is informathe activity at least five working data before commencement by entering of the activity at www.trc.govt.nz/informcouncil; and www.trc.govt.nz/informcouncil; and the activity complies with the Marin Mammals Protection (West Coast Island Sanctuary) Notice 2008.  Additional standards/terms/conditions in Estuaries Unmodified and Estuaries McCother the activity does not have an adverse effect on significant indigenous biodiversity, including those identified Schedule 4 [Significant indigenous biodiversity]; and (40)  (d) the activity does not have a significant adverse effect on the values associated in Schedule 4 [Significant indigenous biodiversity]; and (40)	ys a details d	Policy reference		

Rule 12A	Seismic surveying (37) (40) (41) (42) (43) (44) (51)									
	Activity	Rule	Coastal management area	Classification	Sta	ndards/terms/conditions	Mat	ters of control/discretion	Policy reference	
	Discharge of energy 12 for the purpose of seismic surveying into water in the coastal	12A Outstan	Outstanding Value	Controlled	<u>(a)</u>	Taranaki Regional Council is informed of the activity at least five working days before commencement by entering details of the activity at	Control is reserved over:		General	
			Estuaries Unmodified				(a)	location (including any buffer distances), method, timing and	Policies 1 to 21 and	
	marine area		Estuaries Modified			www.trc.govt.nz/informcouncil; and		notification of works;	Activity-bas	
	and any associated:		Open Coast		<u>(b)</u>	(a) Tthe activity complies with 2013 Code	(b)	notification of works;	Policy 4	
	(a) placement of monitoring		Port			of Conduct for Minimising Acoustic Disturbance to Marine Mammals from Seismic Survey Operations the Marine	(c)	effects on other authorised structures		
	equipment; and					Mammals Protection (West Coast North	(d)	or activities;		
	(b) noise.					Island Sanctuary) Notice 2008;	(e)	effects on indigenous biodiversity		
					<u>(c)</u>	(d) the activity complies with the general standards in Section 8.6.	(f)	values;		
	Note: If the activity is				Add	ditional standards/terms/conditions for the	(c)	effects on cultural and historic,		
	not covered by this Rule				pla	cement of monitoring equipment:	(g)	heritage values;		
	or does not meet the standards, terms and				<u>(d)</u>	(b)-the activity does not have an adverse effect on significant indigenous	(d)	effects on navigation;		
	conditions in this Rule refer to Rule 13 or Rule 14 depending on the Coastal Management Area involved.					biodiversity, including those identified in Schedule 4 [Significant indigenous biodiversity]: and	(e)	effects of noise and light;		
							(f)	monitoring and information		
							(h)	requirements;		
					adverse effect on the values associated		(i)	duration of consent; and		
						with-taonga species identified in Schedule 4C [Taonga species].	(i)	review of consent conditions		

Rules 25 and 25A	Placement or erection of a hard protection structure									
	Activity	Rule	Coastal management area	Classification	Standards/terms/conditions	Matters of control/discretion(32)(61)	Policy reference			
	Placement or erection of a hard protection structure and any associated:  a) occupation of space (including renewal of occupation) in the common marine and coastal area; b) disturbance of the foreshore or seabed; c) deposition in, on or under the foreshore or seabed; and d) discharge of sediment.  Note: If the activity does not come within or		Outstanding Value Estuaries Unmodified Estuaries Modified Open Coast Port	Discretionary			General Policies 1 to 21 and Activity-base Policies 22 31, 32, 33, 3 35, 39, 40, 4 42, 44, 45, 4			
	meet the standards, terms and conditions in this Rule refer to Rule 25A or Rule 34.									
		on stri Rule	<u>Coasta</u> l			Matters of control/discretion	Policy			
	in this Rule refer to Rule 25A or Rule 34.  Placement or erection of a hard protection	<u>Rule</u> <u>25A</u>				Matters of control/discretion	Policy reference Genera Policies 1 to 21 and Activity-ba Policies 22, 31, 32, 34, 35, 39, 41, 42, 44, 46, 49			

Amendments (additions are identified with underlined text; deletions are identified with struck out text)
8.6.2 Light
Light sources will be shielded so that they do not have an adverse effect on significant indigenous biodiversity, and the light source is not directly visible from any residence, vehicle on a public road or ship under navigation, except in the following cases:
(a) Navigation aids; or
(b) Lighting required under the Acts of Parliament for the safety of ships or offshore installations and aircraft.
Regionally important infrastructure means infrastructure of regional and/or national importance and is:  (a)  (l) arterial pipelines and pumping station for the collection and conveyance of wastewater and stormwater and wastewater treatment plants.
Schedule 4 – Significant indigenous biodiversity
This schedule identifies indigenous species (refer Schedule 4A below), ecosystems and habitats (refer Schedule 4B below) identified as being regionally significant for their coastal indigenous biodiversity values, as at the time the Plan was made operative. The schedule supports the application of Policy 14 of this Plan.
Schedule 4A includes a table identifying coastal indigenous flora and fauna-species identified as threatened or at risk of extinction as defined by the New Zealand Threat Classification System and the International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources classification. Regionally Distinctive species are also included in this table. Naturally rare and uncommon ecosystem types found on the Taranaki coast are listed below the table.
Schedule 4B identifies sensitive marine benthic habitats found within or in the vicinity of the Taranaki CMA.

# Amendments (additions are identified with underlined text; deletions are identified with struck out text) **Provision** Schedule 4A - Threatened, At Risk and Regionally distinctive Species Significant species and ecosystems Threatened, At Risk and Regionally Distinctive Species The table below identifies coastal indigenous flora and fauna species identified as 'Threatened' or 'At Risk' of extinction as defined by the New Zealand Threat Classification System and the International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources classification. 'Regionally Distinctive' indigenous flora and fauna species are also included in this table. For further information please refer to the Department of Conservation website. Table 1: Threatened at risk and regionally threatened indigenous species found within or in the vicinity of the Taranaki Coastal Marine Area. [Table unchanged] Rare and uncommon ecosystem types found on the Taranaki coast Coastal systems: Active sand dunes Coastal turfs Shingle beaches Coastal rock stacks Coastal cliffs of acid rocks Vertebrate induced: Seabird burrowed soils · Marine mammal rockeries and haul outs. Coastal wetlands: Dune slacks Estuaries Lagoons Ephemeral wetlands Detailed descriptions of these ecosystem types can be found at http://www.landcareresearch.co.nz/publications/factsheets/rare-ecosystems.

<ul> <li>Database Investigation. Information on the r Consequently sensitive habits identified in the area contains significant indigenous biodivers indigenous biodiversity values in accordance. Plan and have been mapped where appropria</li> </ul>		with only a small area actually having been sampled also occur within the Taranaki CMA. The entire coast ome coastal ecosystems and areas containing signific
Table 2: Known significant indigenous biodive	rsity areas found on the Taranaki coast.	
Significant indigenous biodiversity areas found on the Taranaki coast	Ecosystem types / description	<u>Information sources</u>
<u>Estuaries</u>	As identified in Schedule 1 Estuaries modified and Estuaries unmodified.	Schedule 1, Coastal Plan maps, Biodiversity port vegetation)
Near shore reefs	Include those areas identified in the Coastal Plan maps as near shore reefs (note that their extent, location and distribution is based on the Councils best knowledge at the time of writing)	Coastal Plan maps
<u>Eelgrass</u>		Biodiversity portal
Marine reserves, marine protected areas	Ngā Motu (Sugar Loaf Islands) Marine Protected Area, Tapuae Marine Reserve and Parininihi Marine Reserve	Coastal Plan maps, Biodiversity portal
Specific outstanding coastal areas	Schedule 2 of the Coastal Plan – Waihī Stream to Pariokariwa Point and Parininihi; Mimi Estuary; Paritūtū, Ngā Motu (Sugar Loaf Islands) and Tapuae; Hangatahua (Stony) River; Oaonui (Sandy Bay); Kaūpokonui; Kapuni Stream; Whenuakura Estuary; Waipipi Dunes; Project Reef; North and South Traps; Waverley Beach and Waitōtara	Coastal Plan maps
Significant seabird areas	South Taranaki Bight to Cook Straight. Significant area for pelagic seabirds feeding, breeding and passage. In Taranaki, this area represents the area from Oeo to Wainui out to 12 nautical miles.	<u>Coastal Plan maps</u> <u>Further information can be found at https://www.forestandbird.org.nz/resources/importanew-zealand-seabirds</u>
Seabird nesting and feeding areas	Little blue penguin, NZ dotterel, Oyster catcher, White-fronted tern, Red-billed gull nesting and breeding, pelagic seabird nesting and coastal bird feeding areas.	Biodiversity portal
	Marine mammal rookeries and haul outs	Biodiversity portal
Rare and uncommon ecosystem types	Coastal systems: active sand dunes, coastal turfs, shingle beaches, coastal rock stacks and coastal cliffs of acid rocks  Vertebrate induced: seabird burrowed soils  Coastal wetlands: dune slacks, Lagoons, Ephermeral wetlands	<u>Detailed descriptions of these ecosystem types can http://www.landcareresearch.co.nz/publications/facecosystems</u>

Provision Amendments (additions are identified with underlined text; deletions are identified with struck out text)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>x</sup> Pelagic seabirds are those seabirds that spend the majority of their lives at sea, only coming ashore during breeding seasons.

Provision	Amendments (additions are identified with underlined text; deletions are identified with struck out text)							
	Sensitive marine benthic habitats (confirmed or suspected to be in the Taranaki CMA)	(Beds of) large bivalve molluscs, Brachiopods, Bryozoans (thickets), Calcareous tube worm (thickets), Macro-algal (beds), Sponge (gardens), Rhodolith (maerl beds), Chaetopteridae worm (fields), Sea pens (field), Stony coral (thickets), Xenophyophores (sessile protozoan beds)	Information has been taken from Cawthron, (August 2016), Sensitive Habitats and Threatened Species in the Taranaki Coastal Marine Area (TCMA) — Database Investigation. Information on the marine benthic habitats within the Taranaki CMA is still very limited with only a small area actually having been sampled. Consequently sensitive habits identified in the vicinity of the Taranaki CMA have also been listed as these may also occur within the Taranaki CMA.					
	Note: Known significant indigenous biodiversity areas in the coastal marine area have been mapped on the Coastal Plan maps where appropriate. However relevant data or areas of interest across the wider coastal environment (such as coastal wetlands, indigenous vegetative cover and areas set aside for the full or partial protection of indigenous biodiversity) may also found on the Taranaki Regional Council's LocalMaps for biodiversity.							